

# Contents

## **Introduction 1**

*Albert L. Stevens and Dedre Gentner*

## **1. Some Observations on Mental Models 7**

*Donald A. Norman*

References 14

## **2. Phenomenology and the Evolution of Intuition 15**

*Andrea A. diSessa*

Introduction 15

Springiness 17

Ohm's P-Prim 23

Rolling and Pivoting 26

A Note on Abstraction 29

Persistent False Intuitions 30

Summary and Conclusion 32

References 33

## **3. Surrogates and Mappings: Two Kinds of Conceptual Models for Interactive Devices 35**

*Richard M. Young*

Different Kinds of Mental Models 37

Surrogate Models 40

Task/Action Mapping Models 44

Discussion 50

References 52

- 4. Qualitative Reasoning About Space and Motion 53**  
*Kenneth D. Forbus*  
 Introduction 53  
 Spatial Descriptions 55  
 Describing a Particular Motion 59  
 Describing Possible Motions 62  
 Answering Questions 66  
 Discussion 68  
 References 72
- 5. The Role of Problem Representation in Physics 75**  
*Jill H. Larkin*  
 Problem Representations 76  
 Empirical Studies 84  
 Possibilities for Instruction 93  
 Summary 96  
 References 97
- 6. Flowing Waters or Teeming Crowds: Mental Models of Electricity 99**  
*Dedre Gentner and Donald R. Gentner*  
 A Structure-Mapping Theory of Analogical Thinking 101  
 Two Analogies for Electricity 107  
 Electricity and Water—An Analogy 108  
 Experiments on Analogies for Electricity 111  
 Experiment 1 117  
 Experiment 2 119  
 Discussion 124  
 References 127
- 7. Human Reasoning About a Simple Physical System 131**  
*Michael D. Williams, James D. Hollan, and Albert L. Stevens*  
 Introduction 131  
 An Example of the Phenomenology 132  
 Defining Mental Model 133  
 An Analysis of a Protocol 135  
 A Critique 150  
 Conclusions 152  
 Appendix 1: Questions 153  
 References 153

- 8. Assumptions and Ambiguities in Mechanistic Mental Models 155**  
*Johan de Kleer and John Seely Brown*  
 Introduction 155  
 Qualitative Simulations 156  
 Ambiguities, Assumptions and Mechanisms 172  
 Implications of the Theory 180  
 References 190
- 9. Understanding Micronesian Navigation 191**  
*Edwin Hutchins*  
 Caroline Island Navigation 192  
 Some Anomalous Interpretations 200  
 An Alternative Model 210  
 Discussion 223  
 References 225
- 10. Conceptual Entities 227**  
*James G. Greeno*  
 Analogies Between Domains 229  
 Reasoning with General Methods 239  
 Computational Efficiency 247  
 Planning 249  
 Conclusions 250  
 References 251
- 11. Using the Method of Fibres in Mecho to Calculate Radii of Gyration 253**  
*Alan Bundy and Lawrence Byrd*  
 Introduction 253  
 Continuous Measure Systems 254  
 Choosing Continuous Measure Systems 256  
 Uniformity 259  
 A Worked Example 261  
 Conclusion 264  
 References 266

<b>12. When Heat and Temperature Were One</b>	<b>267</b>
<i>Marianne Wiser and Susan Carey</i>	
The Experimenters' Enterprise	271
Source-Recipient Model	274
Evidence for the Source-Recipient Model	276
Studies of Artificial Freezing	276
The Experimenters' Thermal Concepts	289
Were Heat and Temperature Differentiated?	290
What Next?	294
History of Science and the Novice-Expert Shift	294
References	296
<b>13. Naive Theories of Motion</b>	<b>299</b>
<i>Michael McCloskey</i>	
Misconceptions about Motion	300
A Naive Theory of Motion	305
Individual Differences	311
Historical Parallels: The Medieval Impetus Theory	315
Naive Theories and Physics Instruction	318
A Brief Review of Related Research	319
Concluding Remarks	321
References	322
<b>14. A Conceptual Model Discussed by Galileo and Used Intuitively by Physics Students</b>	<b>325</b>
<i>John Clement</i>	
The "Motion Implies a Force" Preconception	326
Discussion of Similar Arguments in Galileo's Writings	331
Summary of Characteristics for the "Motion Implies a Force" Preconception	333
Post Course Results	334
Implications for Instruction	335
Theoretical Implications	337
References	338
Appendix 1: Example of a Transcript from the Rocket Problem	340
<b>Author Index</b>	<b>341</b>
<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>345</b>