

Contents

List of figures	xiii
List of plan policy extracts	xv
List of tables	xvii
Preface and acknowledgements	xix
Credits	xxiii
1 Introduction: origins, methods and structure	1
<i>Introduction</i>	1
<i>The design dimension in planning</i>	1
<i>The origins of the research</i>	4
<i>Key research questions</i>	5
The intended scope of the study	5
Research for the Department of the Environment	6
<i>Content analysis: strengths and weaknesses</i>	7
Selecting plans for analysis	8
Detailed case studies	10
<i>Further research for the ESRC project</i>	11
<i>The organization of the book</i>	12
2 The development of design policy in England	15
<i>Introduction</i>	15
<i>The development of policy</i>	15
The origins of design control in town planning schemes	15
The 1932 Act and 1933 Circular	18
The 1930s 'battle of the styles'	18
Design in comprehensive development control	18
Ministerial advice	20
The development of conservation legislation	22
Design guidance and the critique of the standards approach	23

Unfettering the development industry: Circular 22/80	26
Design considerations in use in development control	27
The Prince of Wales and Francis Tibbalds: new design codes	28
Ministerial enthusiasm and new design advice, 1990	31
The 'green agenda' and ecological urban design	31
District-wide plans and a plan-led system	32
The pursuit of 'quality' in town and country, 1994-96	33
<i>The key themes in government advice</i>	34
Design is largely a matter of elevations and architectural form	34
Restraint in the operation of control	35
Leaving initiative with the architect and developer	35
Valid considerations in design	35
The development and its context	36
Constructive and professional advice to the applicant	36
The subjectivity of aesthetics	36
A two-tier system of control	37
Publicity, participation and education	37
A flawed orthodoxy and a lack of leadership	37
<i>Critiques of the operation of design control</i>	38
<i>Conclusion</i>	39
 3 Central government advice on design and scrutiny of plan policies	44
<i>Introduction</i>	44
<i>Central government advice on design</i>	45
General design matters: PPG 1, Annex A	45
Sustainable development: PPG 12	47
Conservation areas and listed buildings: PPG 15	47
Other sources of design advice	51
Housing design: PPG 3 and PPG 13	51
Industrial and commercial development: PPG 4 and PPG 6	52
Open space and nature conservation: PPG 9 and PPG 17	53
Green belts and countryside: PPG 2 and PPG 7	54
Other functional design considerations: disabled access, crime and noise	55
Advertisements and satellite dishes	56
Trees and landscaping	56
<i>Summary: advice on design policies</i>	57
Enhancement proposals	58
<i>The content of development plans and design policy formulation</i>	58
<i>The impact of government advice on plan policy</i>	59
A plan-led system?	60
'Presumptions against' and 'non-land-use' policies	60
The new focus on plan content	61
<i>DoE regional office scrutiny of policy content and force</i>	61
Policies should not be over-prescriptive	62
Policies should not be over-detailed	62
Policies should be flexible	63
Policies should not set mandatory standards	63
Policies should not constitute presumptions against development	63

Non-land-use policies should be excluded from the plan	63
Policies should not be confused with guidance	64
Conservation policies should not seek preservation and enhancement	64
Policies should not be vague	65
Policies should not be long-winded and imprecise	65
Policies should be positively phrased where possible	65
Policies should be justified	66
Resolving these criticisms	66
<i>Conclusion</i>	67
Recommendations for action	67
 4 The fundamentals of design: substantive and procedural theory as a basis for policy	 68
<i>Introduction</i>	68
<i>Exploring the substance of design</i>	68
Design as external appearance	68
Aesthetics and design	69
Responsive, operational and inferential modes of perception	70
The townscape tradition	72
Social concerns and urban design	73
The public realm	74
Urban experience and public perceptions	75
Developing principles of urban design	76
Ecological urban design and sustainability	79
Components of urban design	80
<i>Procedural aspects of design</i>	81
Design as a process	83
Creating a climate for good design	84
The 'public interest' in design	86
The scale dimension of urban design	87
The time dimension of urban design	88
<i>Conclusion</i>	88
Recommendations for action	89
 5 Policy conception, organization, expression and presentation	 92
<i>Introduction</i>	92
<i>A theoretical basis for policy conception and organization</i>	92
<i>Central government advice</i>	95
<i>Policy organization</i>	96
Overall plan strategy and design objectives	98
Location of design policies	99
<i>Policy expression</i>	101
Key factors in expression	101
Types of expression	101
<i>Policy phrasing, conciseness and language</i>	109
Lower-case text and reasoned justification	111
Use of maps and illustrations	112
<i>Conclusion</i>	114
Recommendations for action	114

6	Appraisal and consultation as a basis for design policy	116
	<i>Introduction</i>	116
	<i>A theoretical basis for appraisal and consultation</i>	117
	<i>Central government advice on appraisal and consultation</i>	119
	<i>Appraisal in current plans</i>	121
	<i>The key requirements of appraisals</i>	123
	The need for comprehensive methodologies	123
	The importance of being analytical rather than descriptive	129
	The need for participative, collaborative and comprehensible appraisals	131
	The need for appraisals to be resource efficient	133
	<i>Other potential consultation initiatives</i>	136
	<i>Conclusion</i>	138
	Recommendations for action	139
7	Urban design	141
	<i>Introduction</i>	141
	<i>A theoretical basis for urban design policy</i>	141
	<i>Central government advice on urban design policy</i>	142
	<i>Urban design in current plans</i>	143
	The lack of theory in policy	143
	<i>Design strategies</i>	144
	New settlements and urban villages	147
	Sustainable urban forms	149
	<i>Perceptual elements</i>	151
	<i>Townscape</i>	155
	Views and skyline protection	158
	<i>Urban form</i>	161
	Density	161
	Residential density	163
	Building height	164
	Massing	165
	Scale and building form	166
	Morphology and grain	166
	Daylight and sunlight	167
	<i>Public realm</i>	169
	Mixed use	171
	Crime and safety	173
	Accessibility	174
	Public art	177
	<i>The suburban public realm: layout</i>	177
	Highway layout	178
	Parking	178
	Sustainable layouts	179
	Layouts: the public and private realms	179
	<i>Alternative approaches to writing urban design policies</i>	182
	Policies for particular contexts	182
	Policies for particular development types	188
	Scale differentiation policies	195
	<i>Conclusion</i>	196
	Recommendations for action	197
	<i>Notes</i>	199

8	Architecture	200
	<i>Introduction</i>	200
	<i>A theoretical basis for architectural policy</i>	201
	The fallacies of architectural judgement	202
	The contemporary dilemma of style and façade	203
	<i>Central government advice on architecture policy</i>	206
	<i>Architectural policy coverage in current plans</i>	206
	<i>Architectural policies</i>	208
	Architectural skills	209
	Encouraging contemporary design	209
	Visual appropriateness: relating architecture to the context	213
	Visual appropriateness: expressing a building's use and importance	214
	Visual appropriateness: expressing a building's form and structure	215
	Scale as a key aspect of architecture	216
	Visual interest and richness	216
	Architectural style	218
	Materials	218
	Minority group architectural expression	223
	Personalization	223
	Architectural responses to the public realm	224
	Sustainable architecture	224
	<i>Conclusion</i>	226
	Recommendations for action	228
9	Landscape	230
	<i>Introduction</i>	230
	<i>A theoretical basis for landscape policy</i>	231
	<i>Central government advice on landscape policy</i>	232
	<i>Landscape policy coverage in current plans</i>	233
	<i>Landscape policies</i>	237
	<i>Landscape appraisal</i>	237
	<i>A strategic greenspace frame for development</i>	240
	Open space	245
	Landscape frameworks	246
	<i>Landscaping</i>	247
	Trees	249
	The selection of species	249
	Hard landscaping	253
	<i>Landscape and planning procedures</i>	255
	Site appraisals of landscape	256
	Landscape details in applications	256
	Landscape as a reserved matter	258
	Management during construction	258
	Landscape implementation and establishment	258
	<i>The need for new government guidance</i>	260
	<i>Conclusion</i>	261
	Recommendations for action	262

10	Conservation and listed buildings	264
	<i>Introduction</i>	264
	<i>A theoretical basis for conservation policy</i>	264
	<i>Central government advice on conservation</i>	269
	<i>Conservation policies in current plans</i>	272
	Conservation area designation and boundary review	273
	Conservation area character assessments	276
	Assessment methodologies	277
	Enhancement proposals	278
	An overarching conservation policy	280
	Urban design in conservation areas	281
	Architecture policies	284
	Façadism and demolition	287
	Landscape policies	287
	Development minutiae	290
	Special design process considerations in conservation areas	292
	Listed buildings policies	293
	<i>Conclusion</i>	296
	Recommendations for action	297
11	Design process and procedure policies: implementation and monitoring	299
	<i>Introduction</i>	299
	<i>A theoretical basis for process policies</i>	299
	<i>Central government advice</i>	301
	<i>Process policies in current plans</i>	302
	<i>Design and planning procedures</i>	303
	Seeking design advice	304
	Site appraisal	306
	Design briefing	307
	Phasing	307
	Application presentation	309
	<i>Implementation</i>	310
	A corporate approach to enhancement	311
	<i>Monitoring</i>	311
	<i>Conclusion</i>	314
	Recommendations for action	315
12	Supplementary design guidance and development plans	316
	<i>Introduction</i>	316
	<i>A theoretical basis for supplementary guidance</i>	316
	<i>Central government advice</i>	317
	<i>Design guidance in contemporary plans</i>	321
	Types of design guidance found in plans	322
	The relation of guidance to policy	325
	<i>Conclusion</i>	331
	Recommendations for action	331
13	The effectiveness of design policies	333
	<i>Introduction</i>	333

<i>A preliminary study of effectiveness</i>	334
<i>Consumers' views of plan effectiveness</i>	334
A low awareness level of policy content	335
Policies are clear and easy to understand	336
Development interests prefer very general policies but amenity interests seek strong and specific policies	336
Consumers find the policies broadly acceptable	336
Most consumers positively endorse the policies	337
The new policies will not change current control practice	337
New design policies will not achieve better design	338
The nature of the development process, the lack of design skills and poor public taste are the chief barriers to better design	338
Supplementary design guidance should be included with the plan	338
<i>Planners' perspectives on effectiveness</i>	339
Effective policies are those that win appeals	339
Effectiveness can be achieved by using policies to educate controllers	339
Effectiveness can be achieved through ensuring the consistent application of clear policies	340
Effectiveness can be achieved by increasing architectural patronage and the exercise of architectural skills	340
Policies will not be effective in raising overall design quality without public investment and proactive intervention	340
Good policies still require skilled staff and time to ensure effective implementation	341
Conservation policies remain the most effective design control policies	341
Planners concurred with the observation that public awareness of plan content was very low	341
Planners believe that policies need to be strongly expressed, tailored to the locality and quite specific, to be capable of being effectively implemented	342
<i>Assessing planners' perceptions</i>	342
<i>Assessing the evidence of appeals</i>	343
<i>Assessing effectiveness in terms of design outcomes</i>	343
<i>Conclusion</i>	344
 14 <i>Conclusions</i>	 346
<i>Introduction</i>	346
The 'policy-writing jamboree'	347
<i>Setting priorities for policy improvement and development</i>	348
Tailoring the recommendations to the locality	348
Utilizing control experience in policy-writing	349
<i>The substantive recommendations</i>	349
A process view of design	350
The fundamental importance of context, broadly conceived	350
Integrate built and natural environmental concerns, and emphasize sustainability	351

Appraisal of area character should underpin design policies and solutions	351
Design has a strategic and spatial dimension	352
Design policies must provide a framework for supplementary design guidance	352
A comprehensive urban design policy will be the cornerstone of design policy	353
Policies should pay special attention to the prevention of overdevelopment	353
Architectural policies should encourage the exercise of architectural skills and the development of contemporary designs that none the less respect their context	353
Landscape rather than landscaping is seen as a critical design issue at all scales of design thinking, and as a key consideration in sustainable development	354
Conservation policies should place more emphasis upon architectural policies and opportunities for new development, while the setting of listed buildings should be emphasized in policy	354
The implementation aspects of policy always need to be carefully considered, and policies can be written to facilitate this	355
Design policies need to be effectively monitored to assess and improve their effectiveness, and to ensure political and public support for design control	355
<i>New central government advice</i>	356
Design	356
<i>Impediments to improved design control</i>	360
The development process and design quality	360
Public taste and visual literacy	361
The design skills of planners	362
The commitment of councillors to design quality	362
Public sector leadership in design quality	363
<i>Refuting the criticisms of design control</i>	364
Bibliography	367
General	367
Central government advice	386
Circulars	386
Planning Policy Guidance Notes	387
Legislation	387
Appendix A: List of plans content analysed	388
Appendix B: Design advice in PPG 1, February 1997	391
Design	391
Annex A: handling of design issues	392
Index	395